# 2AC

## Case

### Peak Oil

#### Not going for it. Extend peak oil isn’t coming. We still win 100% risk of waste advantage.

## T

#### We meet: Nuclear fuel recycling is energy production.

World Nuclear Association 12 [Processing of Used Nuclear Fuel, http://www.world-nuclear.org/info/inf69.html]

Used nuclear fuel has long been reprocessed to extract fissile materials for recycling and to reduce the volume of high-level wastes. ¶ New reprocessing technologies are being developed to be deployed in conjunction with fast neutron reactors which will burn all long-lived actinides. ¶ A significant amount of plutonium recovered from used fuel is currently recycled into MOX fuel; a small amount of recovered uranium is recycled. ¶ A key, nearly unique, characteristic of nuclear energy is that used fuel may be reprocessed to recover fissile and fertile materials in order to provide fresh fuel for existing and future nuclear power plants. Several European countries, Russia and Japan have had a policy to reprocess used nuclear fuel, although government policies in many other countries have not yet addressed the various aspects of reprocessing.¶ Over the last 50 years the principal reason for reprocessing used fuel has been to recover unused uranium and plutonium in the used fuel elements and thereby close the fuel cycle, gaining some 25% more energy from the original uranium in the process and thus contributing to energy security. A secondary reason is to reduce the volume of material to be disposed of as high-level waste to about one fifth. In addition, the level of radioactivity in the waste from reprocessing is much smaller and after about 100 years falls much more rapidly than in used fuel itself.¶

#### Counter interpretation:

#### The aff has to affect both resource extraction and conversion into energy

Australian Government, Department of Climate Change and Energy Efficiency 2011 [“Energy Production and Consumption,” http://www.climatechange.gov.au/government/initiatives/national-greenhouse-energy-reporting/publications/supplementary-guidelines/energy-production-consumption.aspx]

Production of energy: in relation to a facility, means the:

1. extraction or capture of energy from natural sources for final consumption by or from the operation of the facility or for use other than in the operation of the facility
2. manufacture of energy by the conversion of energy from one form to another form for final consumption by or from the operation of the facility, or for use other than in the operation of the facility (regulation 2.23(3) NGER Regulations).

#### We meet the counter-interpretation: recycling involves both the act of reprocessing the used fuel and using it to create new nuclear energy.

#### Our interp good:

A. Predictability – Only our interpretation guarantees link arguments to both extraction and the burning of resources to produce energy. This is crucial link ground for pollution DAs and domestic/foreign energy tradeoff DAs.

B. Limits: Requiring the aff to both extract and convert the energy is necessary to eliminate affs that only extract, like capture carbon or methane or stockpile oil as a strategic military reserve with heg advantages. Also key to prevent affs that only burn fuels like Bataille-style affs that encourage rapid consumption or R&D affs that incentivize new ways to burn the same resources.

C. We’re not effects t – they’re both part of the same process: reprocessing and new energy.

#### Competing interpretations are bad: Race to the bottom: they’re just trying to limit out one more case

#### Prefer reasonability: as long as we’re reasonably topical, there’s no reason to pull the trigger. Don’t vote on potential abuse.

### CP

#### Perm do both.

#### Perm do the CP—not competitive

#### a. they’re plan plus. They just do the plan with an assessment.

#### b. our interpretation is that counterplans must garner competition off of both functional and textual competition. This limits out abusive counterplans like the dollar PIC and the period PIC and leads to substantive clash.

#### Their ev is in the context of LOAN GUARANTEES FOR SOLAR ENERGY. Not about the affirmative. Make them read a specific card.

#### No solvency: Need to act quickly to prevent peak oil and waste blowing up on site. They kill the time frame.

#### Reviews takes several years and can cost millions – EISs prove.

Cole et al 4 (Brian L., DrPH, Project Manager, Health Impact Assessment Group, UCLA School of Public Health, “Prospects for Health Impact Assessment in the United States”, <http://www.precaution.org/lib/06/prospects_for_hia_in_the_u.s.040601.pdf>, Acc: 7/23/12, og)

The preparation of an EIS can be extremely time consuming and resource intensive (ibid.). Preparation time and costs vary by agency and project. Although the CEQ recommends that EISs should take a year or less to complete, in practice, often one to two years are required and sometimes substantially longer. For instance, on Department of Energy (DOE) projects EIS costs typically range from hundreds of thousands of dollars to several million dollars (U.S. DOE 2000); however, the costs of some EISs are in the tens of millions of dollars for very complex or controversial projects.

#### CP destroys the plan – at best, it causes errors and generates controversy – it’s not meant for policies.

Cole et al 4 (Brian L., DrPH, Project Manager, Health Impact Assessment Group, UCLA School of Public Health, “Prospects for Health Impact Assessment in the United States”, <http://www.precaution.org/lib/06/prospects_for_hia_in_the_u.s.040601.pdf>, Acc: 7/23/12, og)

While NEPA and CEQ guidelines call for the assessment of environmental impacts of most “major federal actions,” including projects, programs, and policies (40 Code of Federal Regulations, sec. 1508.18 [1984]), many informants told us that, in practice, the EIA process is largely geared to assessing the consequences of place-based projects. The CEQ itself has acknowledged that “NEPA is virtually ignored in formulating specific policies and often is skirted in developing programs” (Council on Environmental Quality 1997a: 11). This omission is of concern since the broad, multifaceted effects of programs and policies have greater impacts on both the environment and human health than most brick-and-mortar projects. One reason for the reluctance to apply EIA to programs and policies may be the relative difficulty of predicting their impacts. Even forming a clear picture of how a policy will be implemented and operationalized can be difficult (ibid.). Predicting the impacts of a brick-and-mortar project, such as an electrical generating plant, is usually more straightforward and involves less uncertainty, because the exact parameters of the project are known from the outset and because data from similar projects in other locations can provide a solid basis for projections of potential impacts from the proposed project. With few data to guide the estimation of impacts stemming from a proposed policy, numerous assumptions must be made, increasing the likelihood of error and opening the way for challenge by opponents.

### Elections

#### Romney will win – most accurate polls

Chambers 9/18 (Dean, Arlington Conservative, “Mitt Romney likely election win indicated by polls from key swing states”, http://www.examiner.com/article/mitt-romney-likely-election-win-indicated-by-polls-released-today-from-key-swing)

Two national polls of the presidential race show Mitt Romney leading over President Obama while most of the others show the opposite. Most of the others and not those two polls are wrong because those polls are skewed by over-sampling Democrats. The Rasmussen Reports Daily Presidential Tracking Poll released today shows Romney with a 47 percent to 45 percent lead while the QstarNews Poll released yesterday shows Romney with a larger lead, 55 percent to 45 percent over the president. The UnSkewed Average of polls released today shows Romney with a 7.8 percent lead.¶ Romney's strength in the credible and accurate national polls also is reflected in the limited but available relatively non-skewed polling data in the key swing states. If Mitt Romney wins at least four of the states mentioned below, it will be impossible for Barack Obama to reach the needed 270 electoral votes, therefore Romney's election is quite likely. Below are some of the key swing states to have been recently polled. The map above shows these five states and their value in electoral voters in dark red.¶ Ohio (18 electoral votes): Election observers almost universally agree that both candidate need Ohio to get elected. Many are also believing a number heavily-skewed mainstream media polls showing Obama winning this state. A Rasmussen Reports survey of 500 likely voters released a few days ago for Ohio shows it nearly tied at Obama 47 percent, Romney 46 percent. A poll by Gravis Marketing earlier this month showed the race at Obama 47 percent, Romney 43 percent. Obama can't win this state with 47 percent, nor will be get many of the undecided voters in Ohio, who will break for Romney and allow him to carry this state as George W. Bush did in 2004 running against John Kerry.¶ Florida (29 electoral votes): Mitt Romney has lead in most of the credible polls in Florida for most of this year. A Gravis Marketing poll released today shows Romney leading 48 percent to 47 percent. The latest Rasmussen Reports poll of Florida released a few days ago shows Obama leading 48 percent to 46 percent for Romney. Wit most of the undecided voters going for Romney, there are few odds of this state not going for Romney in November.¶ Virginia (13 electoral votes): The last Rasmussen Reports poll of Virginia released a few days ago show race nearly tied with Obama at 49 percent and Romney at 48 percent. A Gravis Marketing poll released earlier this month shows a Romney 49 percent to 44 percent lead. As with Florida and Ohio, the undecided voters will clearly tip this state to Romney in November.¶ Colorado (9 electoral votes): The Rasmussen Reports poll of Colorado released today shows Romney leading 47 percent to Obama's 45 percent. A recent Denver Post/SurveyUSA poll released a few days ago shows Obama leading 47 percent to 46 percent over Romney. The state has welcomed Romney has a visitor several times and he will no doubt visit there several more times before election day, leading to winning the state.¶ Michigan (16 electoral votes): This state is a bit of a challenge for Mitt Romney, but given that it's somewhat of a home state for him that is suffering through the worst of the economic downturn more than most states, it should be one he can win. The Marketing Research Group poll released today shows Obama leading by just six percent, 47.5 percent to 42.3 percent over Mitt Romney. A recent poll by Democrat-leaning firm Baydoun/Foster shows Obama leading by only 46 percent to 44 percent. The Obama campaign has tried to hit Romney hard with his opposition to the bailouts of General Motors and Chrysler to score political points in Michigan, while just recently the administration rejected a proposal by General Motors to buy-back government-owned stock and remove the federal govenrment from their governance. Skillful use of that and related issues by Romney could allow him to neutralize any advantage Obama has in Michigan regarding the domestic auto industry. That could help Mitt Romney win Michigan if he plays this effectively.¶ Those five states are worth 85 electoral votes and could help either candidate on their road to the White House. The winner of a majority of them will probably win the election, and any candidate winning at least four of them is likely the next president. Mitt Romney seems likely today to win at least four if not all five of them. If Romney wins Michigan, it's game, set and match. Learn to say President Mitt Romney. If he can score an upset win in Pennsylvania, he'll be winning by a landslide.

#### Turn: Nevada – Romney wins now because of Nevada – Obama can’t turn out voters.

Parnes 9-12 (Amie, Obama, Romney locked in tight race in Nevada, The Hill, 12 September 2012, http://thehill.com/homenews/administration/248893-obama-romney-tight-race-nevada, da 9-13-12)

“The stakes are high, the election is going to be close and the president will be fighting for every vote,” an Obama campaign aide said. Romney’s campaign says the economic arguments will win over state voters to his side, providing a gateway to 270 electoral votes. The governor must win a majority of the eight or nine battleground states being contested by the two campaigns and cannot afford to give up Nevada’s votes. Romney campaign aides — who expect to have about a dozen field offices set up before Election Day — predict Obama’s team will have a problem turning out voters. “No state has borne the brunt of the president’s policies like Nevada,” said Mason Harrison, the Romney campaign’s Nevada communications director. “Despite the fact that President Obama has spent the entire summer trying to distract from his failed economic record, he hasn’t been able to convince Nevadans that they are better off than they were almost four years ago.” Obama won the state by 12 points in 2008, but even some Democrats express worry that they wouldn’t have the same outcome this time around given the economy. “The situation definitely isn’t as good as it was in 2008,” the Democratic strategist said. “There’s still big economic uncertainty there, and there are still big problems with housing. People are just taking more sober assessments of this race than they were in 2008.

#### Plan flips Nevada – provides a specific solution to Yucca.

Sanchez, Roll Call Staffer, 8-9 (Humberto, Mitt Romney Tries to Neutralize Yucca Mountain Issue in Quest for Nevada, Roll Call, 9 August 2012, http://www.rollcall.com/news/Mitt-Romney-Tries-to-Neutralize-Yucca-Mountain-Issue-in-Quest-for-Nevada-216786-1.html, da 9-16-12)

Damore thinks Romney’s stance on Yucca is emblematic of his cautious political strategy where he seems to be unwilling to take definitive positions on specific issues for fear of alienating voters. Damore added that Sharron Angle, who ran against Reid in 2010, used the same strategy and came up short in a state where voters are yearning for specific solutions. Nevada has the highest unemployment rate and is first in home foreclosures. “He’s falling into the trap that Sharron Angle fell into,” Damore said. “Everybody knows what the problems are; you don’t have to point out the problems. It’s what are your solutions, and he hasn’t articulated anything.”

#### Turn: Plan key to Florida which is key to the election – addresses voter concerns regarding energy and the economy.

Whitman and Avilla, ‘12

[Christine and Karen, “Nuclear energy = green jobs, economic growth in Fla., beyond”, The Orlando Sentinel, 6-22-12,

http://articles.orlandosentinel.com/2012-06-22/opinion/os-ed-nuclear-energy-florida-jobs-062212-20120621\_1\_nuclear-energy-green-jobs-hispanic-community, RSR]

We all know how critical Florida is to the outcome of this year's election. This week, as Orlando hosts the annual conference of the National Association of Latino Elected and Appointed Officials, all eyes are on the presidential candidates as they speak to Hispanic elected officials — and by extension, to their constituents — about the issues that are top of mind for voters. Notably, the conference addresses two issues also of paramount concern to all Floridians: energy and the economy. From our perspective, these issues are deeply intertwined — and one way that Floridians and the state's thriving Hispanic community can advocate for economic growth through renewed investment in clean energy is by supporting nuclear energy. We need to let the candidates know that Americans are relying on the next president for clean, sustainable energy policies that benefit us all. As we look toward diversifying America's energy portfolio and building out the energy generated by renewables, candidates should look to nuclear energy as one proven way to effectively meet growing demand. In doing so, they are registering their support for well-paying jobs, sustained economic growth and clean, affordable energy options.

#### Funding now. Worthington ev. says subsidies now. Even if no new reactors, there’s already the perception of Obama pushing.

#### Turn: Subsidies for nuclear power popular with the American public.

Bisconti, PhD and President of Bisconti Research Inc., ‘12

[Ann Stoufer, “High Expectations for Nuclear Energy”, NEI, RSR]

Strong majorities support renewing the licenses of nuclear power plants that meet federal safety standards and preparing for new nuclear power plants when needed. Nearly six of 10 surveyed (58 percent) would agree on definitely building new nuclear power plants in the future. The public has moderately favorable perceptions of nuclear plant safety, due in part to high expectations for American technology to advance and a long history without major events in this country. The American public historically does not want to put all of its energy production eggs in one basket. There is near consensus that the country should take advantage of all low-carbon energy sources, including nuclear energy, hydropower and renewable energy. To help make that happen, three-fourths of the public supports loan guarantees for the development of these low-carbon sources.

#### Turn: The plan will be spun as job creation.

Ling, NYT Staff Writer, ‘9

[Katherine, New York Times, 5-19-2009, “Is the solution to the U.S. nuclear waste problem in France?”,

<http://www.nytimes.com/cwire/2009/05/18/18climatewire-is-the-solution-to-the-us-nuclear-waste-prob-12208.html?pagewanted=all> Published, RCM]

The outgoing Bush administration tested the political reaction to reprocessing in 2006 and found 11 communities that showed interest in having a reprocessing facility. The approach promised high-paying jobs for hosting a regional intermediate highly radioactive nuclear waste site, a sort of "energy park."

#### Personality, not policy, matters more to swing voters

Martin 9/18 (Jonathan, 2012, “Why Barack Obama is winning”, http://dyn.politico.com/printstory.cfm?uuid=978F5153-3BFA-42E3-83CA-54E1A0C143DF)

The phenomenon is the result of three powerful factors, according to interviews with some two dozen political veterans from both parties.¶ The first is a rapidly changing, deeply polarized electorate — one in which external circumstances don’t necessarily swing large numbers of voters whose minds are deeply made up — and also one that, on balance, is becoming more Democratic due to demographic trends. In an environment like this, Obama has not seen his political bottom fall out, as happened to George H.W. Bush in 1992, when Al Gore cited a barrage of statistics and taunted, “Everything that should be down is up, and everything that should be up is down.”¶ (POLITICO’s Swing-State Map)¶ But a more hardened political landscape also means that — at the margins — candidate skills and attributes matter more than ever.¶ Obama’s durability, according to polling and interviews, is the result of a unique connection with voters as someone who broke racial barriers in 2008, his ability to evade much the blame for the recession and a brutally effective campaign.¶ Romney’s inability to capitalize on trends with the economy and national mood that would normally create a wide opening for a challenger is in large measure a reflection of his own defects as candidate and failure to sell himself to voters, according to these same sources, many of whom are Republicans hoping to beat Obama. “He came into the general election with a very negative [image] rating and he has not effectively addressed that,” said longtime GOP pollster Jan van Lohuizen, who worked for Romney in 2008. “What they’ve been doing for five months hasn’t worked. At some point, they need to come to the conclusion that it’s not worked.”

#### No Chance of Iranian retaliation – Strikes would be so devastating that they would have no capability to strike back.

Plesch and Butcher, ‘7

[Dr. Dan (Director of the School of Oriental and African Studies’ Centre for International Studies and Diplomacy) and Martin (international consultant on security politics), “Considering a war with Iran: A discussion paper on WMD in the Middle East”, September 2007, School of Oriental and African Studies,

<http://www.rawstory.com/images/other/IranStudy082807a.pdf>]

The US B-2A carries a new earth penetrating conventional weapon, the Massive Ordnance penetrator. The MOP is a 30,000lb bomb carrying 6.000lbs of explosives and capable of penetrating up to 60 meters [200 feet] through 5,000 psi reinforced concrete.5 This puts at risk even the most hardened facilities such as Natanz and increases the flexibility of STRATCOM’s conventional strike options.6 This weapon is in the final testing stage and could be fitted to the B2 bomber in late 2007 or early 2008.7 In recent years, hugely increased funding for military technology has taken "smart bombs" to a new level. New "bunker-busting" conventional bombs weigh only 250lb. According to Boeing, the GBU-39 small-diameter bomb "quadruples" the firepower of US warplanes, compared to those in use even as recently as 2003. A single stealth or B-52 bomber can now attack between 150 and 300 individual points to within a metre of accuracy using the global positioning system.8 One B2 bomber dropped 80 500lb bombs on separate targets in 22 seconds in a test flight. Using just half the available force, 10,000 targets could be attacked almost simultaneously. This strike power alone is sufficient to damage Iranian political, military, economic and transport capabilities. Such a strike would take "shock and awe" to a new level and leave Iran with few if any conventional military capabilities to block the straights of Hormuz or provide conventional military support to insurgents in Iraq. ] The US air force can hit the last-known position of Iranian military units, political leaders and supposed sites of weapons of mass destruction. One can be sure that, if war comes, George Bush will not want to stand accused of using too little force and allowing Iran to fight back. "Global Strike" means that, without any obvious signal, what was done to Serbia and Lebanon can be done overnight to the whole of Iran. We, and probably the Iranians, would not know about it until after the bombs fell. Forces that hide will suffer the fate of Saddam's armies, once their positions are known.

### Russian Oil

#### Oil prices low – expiration of the October contract and declining stock market.

CNN Money, 9-18

[“Oil prices remain lower after a stunning drop”, RSR]

Oil prices remained under pressure Tuesday, less than a day after a sharp, sudden drop that had traders scrambling and economists scratching their heads. The October contract for U.S. crude was down 48 cents to $96.14 a barrel. On Monday, the price of light crude dropped $2.38, or 2.4%, with the contract tumbling more than $3 in less than a minute late in the session. "Energy prices were extremely volatile yesterday," wrote commodities analyst Stephen Schork, editor of The Schork Report. "The crude oil contract took a swan dive in the late afternoon despite a dearth of fundamental or economic news releases -- did another fund just explode?" Schork theorized that the plunge in oil prices might have been caused several factors, including the pending expiration of the October contract, and Monday's drop in stock prices.

#### Oil prices low - Saudi Arabia is acting to lower oil prices.

Reuters, 9-18

[“Saudi Arabia acting to lower oil prices: Gulf source”,

http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/09/18/us-saudi-oil-prices-idUSBRE88H0HB20120918, RSR]

(Reuters) - Saudi Arabia is acting to lower oil prices, a senior Gulf source said on Tuesday, adding that the majority of OPEC producers wanted oil prices around $100 per barrel. The Gulf source told reporters the oil market was well balanced with no shortage of oil supply. Saudi Arabia was producing around 10 million barrels per day (bpd) of crude and other members of the Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries would be increasing output over the next few months. "We would like to see the price coming down and we are working to bring it down," said the Gulf source.

#### Oil prices low - Iran exports down.

Smith, Contributor, 9-17

[Grant, “Oil Trades Near Four-Month High on Signs of Improving Economy”, Bloomberg

http://www.bloomberg.com/news/2012-09-17/oil-trades-near-four-month-high-on-signs-of-improving-economy.html, RSR]

South Korea stopped buying crude from Iran in August after its refiners lost insurance coverage on ships carrying supplies from the Persian Gulf nation. The tanker Freedom, owned by Tehran-based NITC, signaled it’s going to Ulsan in South Korea, IHS Inc. (IHS) ship-tracking data compiled by Bloomberg today show. The vessel, able to carry about 2 million barrels of crude, is scheduled to arrive Oct. 4. Purchases fell to zero last month, reducing imports from Iran for the first eight months of this year by 34 percent from a year earlier to 5.39 million metric tons, according to data posted on the Customs Service’s website Sept. 15. South Korea bought 1.14 million tons of crude oil, or about 270,000 barrels a day, in August 2011.

#### Nuclear renaissance now. Worthington says nuclear is already receiving subsidies and building plants.

#### Link going to be triggered anyway – Russia plans on expanding its own nuclear industry.

Gosling, ‘11

(Tim, Business New Europe, “Russia to keep building nuclear plants despite Fukushima”, The Telegraph, 4-5-11,

http://www.telegraph.co.uk/sponsored/russianow/business/8429048/Russia-to-keep-building-nuclear-plants-despite-Fukushima.html, accessed 8-4-12, RSR)

Among the emerging markets, Russia is the most reliant on nuclear power. Sixteen per cent of its power comes from nuclear energy and it is planning to double nuclear capacity in the next 20 years. “Inevitably, some of these plans might have to be reconsidered, ” said Mr Bubnov. “Russia has a vocal environmental lobby, which might lead to the delay or even cancellation of some projects, leading to higher prices.” However, as Russia’s economy returns to strong growth, the government has little choice but to build new nuclear plants. Before the financial crisis, the supply and demand for power were evenly matched, so further economic growth would be constrained by blackouts. The Energy Ministry plans to cope with rising Russian energy needs by building 18 nuclear power and hydropower plants with a combined installed capacity of 11.2 gigawatts. “It is impossible to speak about a global energy balance without the nuclear power industry,” Mr Putin said at a meeting of the intergovernmental council of the Eurasian Economic Community (EurAsEC). Without waiting for the Fukushima crisis to be resolved and an investigation to be carried out by international experts, Russian authorities ordered an urgent review of all nuclear plant construction projects, both at home and abroad. Tests are already under way to assess the fire- and seismic-proof qualities of the country’s own plants, and facilities will be shut down if necessary,  officials said. “We will take all necessary measures, however much that might cost,” said Alexander Lokshin, deputy director general at the Rosatom state nuclear energy corporation. However, events at Fukushima do not appear to have seriously dented confidence in nuclear power in the Russian industry.

#### Case outweighs and turns the DA. High oil prices trigger US economic collapse. Every other economic indicator is up. That’s Zakaria. This impact is verified by 40 years of data. That’s Li. US economic collapse spreads over eventually to Russia causing nationalistic tensions. That’s Lachman and Auslin.

#### High oil prices bad for Russian econ

#### A.) Oil drives inflationary growth

Aris 12 (Ben Aris - Ben is the editor/publisher of[bne](http://www.bne.eu/) and an Eastern Europe specialist. He has worked as Moscow bureau chief for the Daily Telegraph, contributing editor at The Banker and Euromoney - Russian Economy Showing Signs of Overheating http://www.themoscowtimes.com//article/russian-economy-showing-signs-of-overheating/461657.html#ixzz1zttKtz9A)

Russia's external debt is up slightly to $585 billion, slightly more than the gross international reserves of $513 billion as of the end of June, but this still means that Russia can cover its debt nearly dollar-for-dollar with cash, unlike most Western economies that have national debts of about 100 percent of gross domestic product these days. And even capital outflow is finally slowing and is expected to drop to $9.5 billion in the second quarter, following a $43 billion outflow in the first quarter. All this means that economists are starting to ask whether the economy is overheating. Alexei Ulyukayev, first deputy chairman of the Central Bank, says that when consumer-lending growth rises above 28 percent, the economy is in danger of overheating — and Russia is well beyond that point now. The danger in this lending is that some analysts are suggesting that the quality of loans is falling, which opens banks up to problems if there is another bad external shock from Europe. However, nearly everyone agrees that if this does happen, the Central Bank has more than enough cash in reserve to prop up the banks and avoid a systemic financial crisis. The black spot is in the corporate sector, where companies have already started to destock. One of the reasons the 2008 crisis was so painful was that companies were carrying a lot of inventory to meet the burgeoning demand of a booming market. However, when the crisis struck, these companies basically switched off their machines to save money and sold their inventory instead. The result was that the economy came to a stand still literally overnight, resulting in a 7 percent contraction. The process took about six months to complete, after which companies had to turn their machines on again after stocks ran out to meet new orders and the economy began to recover. This time round, fearing another (and possibility worse) meltdown in Europe, companies have already started destocking before the crisis has even appeared. "As opposed to 2008, when strong consumption was accompanied by overheated industrial production growth, this year we see producers taking a much more cautious approach. In 2010-2011 the recovery in economic growth was at 70 percent, driven by stock building," said Natalya Orlova, chief economist at Alfa Bank. "However, starting in the fourth quarter of 2011, the Russian economy entered a destocking process. According to our estimates, in that quarter inventories contributed minus 0.2 percent to GDP growth and minus 0.4 percent in the first quarter of this year. This was the first sign that the producer started to be cautious earlier than expected." Russia finds itself in a very weird place now. Kolya's experience and the robust consumer demand mean that the economy is getting hot to the point where inflation is starting to rise. Russia's inflation overshot the Central Bank target last month and left it struggling to keep consumer-price growth below last year's record low as a weaker ruble stokes food costs and utility tariffs rise, economists said. "What is surprising is how quickly headline inflation has reversed its deceleration," wrote Alexander Morozov, chief economist at HSBC Holdings Plc. in Moscow in a note to clients. "The Central Bank's job of keeping inflation in the range is seen as 'Mission Impossible.'" But on the other hand, the behavior of companies suggests that the economy is slowing down. Industrial production took a nose dive in March — as it did in the rest of the world as growth collapsed for psychological reasons as much as anything else. This means that the Central Bank should move to bolster confidence and encourage growth. Put in simple terms, the dilemma is: the Central Bank should increase interest rates to curb inflation and cool the economy, and at the same time it should cut rates to encourage more investment and growth. The upshot of this confusion is that economists are forecasting a wide spread of growth rates this year, from at least 3 percent to 5 percent. When spreads on forecasts get this wide, it always means that the experts are basically clueless about what will happen next. To be fair, Russia's strong growth is fragile because it is partly connected to the recovery of the oil price, which is currently back at about $100 a barrel. Because of the lack of reforms and investment, high oil prices are pumping money into the economy, which is feeding through to consumer demand. If oil prices fall — an event the government is preparing for by adding a $60 scenario to its budget planning despite assuming an average price of $115 for this year — then that would quickly take the wind out of Russia's sails. But that has always been Russia's problem. Strong consumer demand has encouraged real progress and investment, but it is still nowhere near what is needed.

#### Inflation outweighs oil price decline

Investment Innovation Business 12 (http://eng.spb-venchur.ru/news/14616.htm)

The major risks for Russia in the near future are likely to come from an overheated economy, rather than falling oil prices, as accelerating consumption and lagging output might fuel inflation, Goldman Sachs warned Friday.¶ The drop in unemployment together with the rise in people's incomes are boosting consumption, while output has yet to catch up to meet growing demand, the company said in a presentation.¶ The trend is unlikely to change in the near future, said Clemens Grafe, Goldman Sachs' chief economist for Russia and CIS.¶ "The risk in Russia now is overheating, as consumption will accelerate further rather than slowing down to a sustainable path," he told a news conference in the company's Moscow office.

#### B.) High oil prices cause corruption which collapses the economy.

Brooke2011— journalist, VOA Russia Bureau Chief, previously Moscow Bureau Chief for Bloomberg and New York Times reporter (James, March 18, 2011, “Russia Gets Giant Boost from Rising Oil Prices” http://www.voanews.com/english/news/economy-and-business/Russia-Gets-Giant-Boost-from-Rising-Oil-Prices-118258659.html)

In one decade, the oil price gyrated wildly - from a low of $8 a barrel in 1998 to a peak of $147 in 2008. Looking at the long term, analysts say Japan's nuclear crisis may benefit Russia by pushing the world energy pendulum away from nuclear toward natural gas. Germany imports almost half of its gas from Russia. Even before the crisis, Russia was investing to increase gas production by 50 percent over the next 20 years.The downside is that high prices ease pressures to cut corruption, to diversify the economy and to lighten the hand of government on business**.** Chris Weafer, chief strategist with Uralsib Capital, fears that the new flood of oil earnings is leading the Kremlin to slow its privatization program. “We have seen it in the Gulf Arab countries. and we saw it in Russia in the last 10 years that as the oil price is rising governments talk about the need for reform and using the money wisely, but as the price goes up too high, the whole process slows down, people become complacent**,** they become lazy, they live the good life as it were, until the collapse comes**,”** he said. “And then then whole process starts again.” In public opinion polls, corruption rivals food prices as the number one public complaint for Russians. According to Transparency International, Russia is the most corrupt of the Group of 20 major economies. Last week in a speech in Moscow, U.S. Vice President Joe Biden clearly warned Russia that corruption scares away investors. “No amount of government cheerleading or public relations or U.S. support or rebranding will bring wronged or nervous investors back to a market they perceive to have these shortcomings**,**” he said. “Only bold and genuine change.“

#### Low oil prices usher necessary economic and political reforms.

[Andrew E. Kramer, New York Times, “Rise in Oil Price Eases Push for Reform in Russia”, 6/3/2009, <http://www.nytimes.com/2009/06/04/business/global/04ruble.html>]

The two previous major oil price slumps in the last quarter-century were followed by significant economic and political changes in Moscow that paved the way for future growth. For a time, it seemed the current oil shock would follow the same path. Indeed, the mood was so glum last winter, when oil dipped below $40 a barrel, that some advisers close to the government suggested that the country might be compelled to open up politically to spur development. At the least, policies encouraging Russia to diversify beyond oil were seen as imminent. What is needed to diversify the economy and stabilize the financial system, critics of the Russian government say, is an overhaul of the courts and a crackdown on corruption to improve property rights and separate the bureaucracy from the economy. But with oil prices now above $60 a barrel, the pressure on the government of Prime Minister Vladimir V. Putin to change has eased, even though the stock market remains 44 percent off its high in December 2007. Instead, an economic strategy that amounts to essentially waiting out the downturn is beginning to take shape.

#### No impact to Russian economy – recession proves.

Blackwill, Deputy Assistant to the President and Deputy National Security Advisor for Strategic Planning, ‘9

[Robert, Former Associate dean of the Kennedy School of Government, RAND, “The Geopolitical Consequences of the World Economic Recession – A Caution”,

http://www.rand.org/pubs/occasional\_papers/2009/RAND\_OP275.pdf]

Now on to Russia. Again, five years from today. Did the global recession and Russia’s present serious economic problems substantially modify Russian foreign policy? No. (President Obama is beginning his early July visit to Moscow as this paper goes to press; nothing fundamental will result from that visit). Did it produce a serious weakening of Vladimir Putin’s power and authority in Russia? No, as recent polls in Russia make clear. Did it reduce Russian worries and capacities to oppose NATO enlargement and defense measures eastward? No. Did it affect Russia’s willingness to accept much tougher sanctions against Iran? No. Russian Foreign Minister Lavrov has said there is no evidence that Iran intends to make a nuclear weapon.25 In sum, Russian foreign policy is today on a steady, consistent path that can be characterized as follows: to resurrect Russia’s standing as a great power; to reestablish Russian primary influence over the space of the former Soviet Union; to resist Western eff orts to encroach on the space of the former Soviet Union; to revive Russia’s military might and power projection; to extend the reach of Russian diplomacy in Europe, Asia, and beyond; and to oppose American global primacy. For Moscow, these foreign policy first principles are here to stay, as they have existed in Russia for centuries. 26 None of these enduring objectives of Russian foreign policy are likely to be changed in any serious way by the economic crisis.

### K

#### Our interpretation is that debate should be a question of the aff plan versus a competitive policy option.

#### This is key to ground and predictability – infinite number of possible kritik alternatives or things the negative could reject explodes the research burden. That’s a voting issue.

#### **Case outweighs. Waste is there packed on-site right now and its going to blow up. It’s also vulnerable to prolif and terrorist attacks that culminate extinction. Also, they can’t solve Yucca long term which also blows up. Infinite consumption doesn’t address the underlying problems of waste storage.**

#### Perm do both. The plan results in infinite energy consumption via reprocessing. It makes possible to infinitely produce energy from a single source. That’s Bastin.

#### You take Bataille’s theories too far – the perm is the best option – we have to avoid indiscriminate violence

Kenneth ITZKOWITZ, 1999, Associate Professor of Philosophy – Marietta College, “To witness spectacles of pain: The hypermorality of Georges Bataille” College Literature, Winter

Yet in our lives there are also limits. It is unlikely that Bataille would applaud Manson for the same reason he ultimately rejects Sade. They are both indiscriminate; they both go too far. "Continuity is what we are after," Bataille confirms, but generally only if that continuity which the death of discontinuous beings can alone establish is not the victor in the long run. What we desire is to bring into a world founded on discontinuity all the continuity such a world can sustain. De Sade's aberration exceeds that limit. (Bataille 1962, 13) In other words, our wasteful consumption must also have limits. To actually approve of our own self-destruction goes too far. Later on in Death and Sensuality, Bataille continues, Short of a paradoxical capacity to defend the indefensible, no one would suggest that the cruelty of the heroes of Justine and Juliette should not be wholeheartedly abominated. It is a denial of the principles on which humanity is founded. We are bound to reject something that would end in the ruin of all our works. If instinct urges us to destroy the very thing we are building we must condemn those instincts and defend ourselves from them. (Bataille 1962, 179-80) This passage is crucial for understanding Bataille's ethics. Usually Bataille writes on behalf of the violence that remains unaffected by absolute prohibitions. Prohibitions cannot obviate this transformative violence. There is always ample motive to produce the experiences of sacred transformation, i.e., to transgress the prohibitions. Yet self-preservation is also a fundamental value for Bataille; there is also ample motive to resist the violence that denies the value of the well being of life itself. As he says in the second of the above passages, we must condemn what threatens to destroy us; our sovereign aspirations can be taken too far. In another passage he speaks of our need "to become aware of . . . [ourselves] and to know clearly what . . . [our] sovereign aspirations are in order to limit their possibly disastrous consequences" (1962, 181). It is when we are ignorant of these aspirations that we are most vulnerable to them, enacting them anyway, albeit inattentively.

#### Plan is a net benefit

#### **a.) The very idea of housing in Yucca Mountain is the standing reserve mentality.**

Bloomfield and Vurdubakis, ‘5

[Brian and Theo (Centre for the Study of Technology and Organisation, Lancaster University Management School), “The secret of Yucca Mountain: reflections on an object in extremis”, Environment and Planning D: Society and Space 2005, volume 23, page 741]

The Yucca Mountain project has been officially trumpeted as the long sought after solution to nuclear waste, but for many others in US society (and beyond) the repository has a very different meaning. If Heidegger (1977) bemoaned what the siting of a hydroelectric plant had done to the Rhine, the technological revealing of nature as standing reserve, the outcry over Yucca Mountain by various US native peoples is no less notable. Indeed, for them the repository implies an act not of purification but, rather, one of defilement. Yucca Mountain has ``long been a place of powerful spiritual energy for the Shoshone and the Paiute. The water in the area is sacred, too, as it is with many desert peoples'' (http://www.sacredland.org/endangered sites pages/ yucca mountain.html). Further, Erikson observes: ``Shoshone and Paiute natives \_ see that whole tract as part of an ancient claim and view its use by federal agencies as `willful trespass'. They have been using Yucca Mountain for at least twelve thousand years ... . The very idea of injecting the most virulent poisons ever known into the body of a mountain seems to them an insult to the earth, an affront to ancestors, and a violation of natural good sense'' (1994, pages 208 ^ 209). Clearly, then, the object Yucca Mountain as well as the idea of turning it into a repository for nuclear waste are perceived within a variety of interpretative horizons. Their meaning and value are formed in relation to a number of different historical, cultural, economic, and political contexts.

#### **b.) SQUO treats atomic energy as an standing reserve, concealing the problems with waste.**

Rawles, Lecturer at the University of Edinburgh, 2k

[Richard, “Coyote Learns to Glow”, Part of “Learning to Glow: A Nuclear Reader”, RSR]

Humans, having gathered uranium from the New Mexican desert not all that far from Yucca Mountain, have harnessed the energy within the atom, for commercial and security purposes, in effect by “tricking" nature out of its secret power. We are aided in our industry by this supposedly "free” energy source. As Martin Heidegger observed, we regard the natural world as a “standing reserve:’ there for the plundering-the military metaphor is more than apt in this case. Having stolen from nature its hidden fire, we delude ourselves into believing that there’s no reckoning, no balancing of accounts, despite even the scientific evidence, which tells us there are no free meals in nature’s unforgiving cycles. We are burdened by the waste from this virtual cornucopia, much as the Greeks of the early classical period projected into Pandora's box of woes the burdens of civilizing fire—its destructive aspects, along with the rituals needed to maintain the fire.

#### Expenditure is not transgressive- limitless consumption is useless theory

Paul Mann, 1999, “The Exquisite Corpse of Georges Bataille” in Masocriticism, p. 67-9

I would like at one and the same time to affirm this model and to dismiss it as the most desperate alibi of all. For “sacrificial consumption” can never become an explicit critical motive.13 At the moment it presents itself as a proper element of some critical method, it degenerates into another useful trope, another bit of intellectual currency, another paper-thin abyss, another proxy transgression; and the force of transgression moves elsewhere, beneath a blinder spot in the critical eye.14 Questions of motive or understanding, the fact that one might be self-critical or at least aware of recuperation, are immaterial: what is at stake here is not self-consciousness but economics, material relations of appropriation and exclusion, assimilation and positive loss. Whatever transgression occurs in writing on Bataille does so only through the stupid recuperation and hence evacuation of the whole rhetoric and dream of transgression, only insofar as the false profundity of philosophy or theory evacuates the false profundities it apes. To justify this as the sublime loss of loss is merely to indulge a paradoxical figure. Excess is not a project but a by-product of any discourse; the interest of Bataillean discourse lies chiefly in the compulsive and symptomatic way it plays with its feces. The spectacle of critics making fools of themselves does not reveal the sovereign truth of death: it is only masocritical humiliation, a pathological attempt to disavow the specter of death. As for the present essay, it makes no claims to any redeeming sacrifice. Far from presenting you with a truer Bataille, far from speaking in his voice more clearly than his other readers, this essay pleads guilty to the indictment against every appropriation. Until philosophy and theory squeal like a pig before Bataille’s work, as he claims to have done before Dali’s canvases, there will be no knowledge of Bataille. In the end, one might have to take and even stricter view: there is no discourse of transgression, either on or by Bataille. None at all. It would be necessary to write a “Postscript to Transgression” were it not for the fact that Foucault already wrote it in his “Preface,” were it not for the fact that Bataille himself wrote it the moment before he first picked up his pen. It makes no difference whether one betrays Bataille, because one lip syncs Bataille’s rhetoric or drones on in the most tedious exposition. All of these satellite texts are not heliotropic in relation to the solar anus of Bataille’s writing, of the executioners he hoped (really?) would meet him in the Bois de Boulogne, or depensives in spite of themselves. It would be sentimental to assign them such privileges. They merely fail to fail. They are symptoms of a discourse in which everyone is happily transgressing everyone else and nothing ever happens, traces of a certain narcissistic pathos that never achieves the magnificent loss Bataille’s text conveniently claims to desire, and under whose cover it can continue to account for itself, hoarding its precious debits in a masocriticism that is anything but sovereign and gloriously indifferent. What is given to us, what is ruinously and profitably exchanged, is a lie. Heterology gives the lie to meaning and discourse gives the lie to transgression, in a potlatch that reveals both in their most essential and constitutive relation. Nothing is gained by this communication except profit-taking from lies. We must indict Bataille as the alibi that allows all of this writing to go on and on, pretending it is nothing it is not, and then turn away from Bataille as from a sun long since gone nova, in order to witness the slow freezing to death of every satellite text. The sacrificial consumption of Bataille has played itself out; the rotten carcass has been consumed: no more alibis. What is at stake is no longer ecstatic sexuality or violent upheavals or bloody sacrifices under the unblinking eye of the sun; nor was it ever, from the very beginning of Bataille’s career. These are merely figures in the melodramatic theater of what is after all a “soft expenditure” (Hollier 1989, xv), a much more modest death, a death much closer to home. It has never been more than a question of the death of the theory and of theory itself as death. Of theory-death. A double fatality.

#### Bataille is wrong—his theories of death and sacrifice are based on non-falsifiable assertions contradicted by real world anthropological data

Olson, Allegheny College, 1994 [Carl, “Eroticism, violence, and sacrifice: A postmodern theory of religion and ritual,” *Method & Theory in the Study of Religion* 6.3, p. 237-238, 241-248]

4. Eroticism and death Without giving any historical proof for his position, Bataille asserts that the origin of eroticism can be traced prior to the division of humanity into those who were free and those who were slaves. It's origins can be found m pre- historic signs of erotic life embodied by figures with large breasts and erect penises, but its foundation is the sexual act itself (Bataille 1989a: 66). The knowledge of death plays an important role m the origin of eroticism. Al-though his claim cannot be refuted or proven, Bataille asserts that prehistoric beings were aware of death, an awareness that gave nse to an awareness of eroticism. The knowledge of death is essential because it gives rise to a sensibility that m turn stimulates eroticism, an extreme emotion that sepa- rates the sexuality of humans from that of animals (Bataille 1989a: 31-32, 23).5 The difference between humans and animals is more precisely defined when he states that "eroticism differs from the animal sexual impulse m that it is, m principle, just as work is, the conscious searching for an end, for sensual pleasure." (Bataille 1989a: 44) There is also an anticipation by the participants m erotic play that it will culminate with sensual pleasure. In the pleasure of erotic play one does not gain anything or become enriched, unlike [continues…] 6. Bataille's theory and the Sun Dance Bataille failed to test his theory of sacrifice by applying it to actual examples of sacrifice m the religions of the world. Havmg defined the nature of sacnfice for Bataille, it is therefore necessary to compare it to an actual sacnfice. In order to demonstrate the shortcomings of Bataille's theory of sacrifice I have chosen to apply it to the Sun Dance of the Sioux. Following this example, I suggest that, contrary to Bataille's theory, a more reasonable interpretation of the Sun Dance can be attained by concentratmg on its symbolism. This approach is suggested by the theoretical work of Clifford Geertz (1971) and Victor Turner (1967; 1968; 1975), the latter of whom refers to a symbol as the smallest umt of ntual or as storage umts of dynamic entities. My account of the Sun Dance relies on the work James R. Walker (1980) because his information was gathered from several different sources, and it represents the most authoritative account available to us of the rite in one period of its history My approach presupposes that the nte and its meaning have continued to change m response to new circumstances for the Sioux. By selectmg this nte, I am bemg eminently fair to Bataille, from one perspective, because the erotic and violent features of the Sun Dance could be used to prove the validity of his theory The complexity of the Sun Dance makes it difficult to interpret. Although he does not consider the Sun Dance of the Sioux, Jorgensen (1972: 206, 236) interprets, for mstance, the Ute and Shoshone nte as an acquisition of power that transforms the person and allows him to gain power, status, and autonomy From another perspective, Melody (1976) interprets the Sun Dance of the Sioux as a commemoration of tribal virtues expressed m the dance, a celebration of the people, an acknowledgment of the generative power of the sun, and a celebration of renewal. The rejoicing over renewal of the world is close to Hultkrantz's mterpretation (1981. 238) of the nte as a recreation of the cosmos. According to Hassnck (1967' 238, 248), the Sun Dance represents a socially umfymg activityactivity and a chance to resolve a conflict between an individual ego and the adjustment to the physical and social forces. And Lewis (1972: 47) mterprets the Sun Dance in terms of its various functions: umfymg force; maintaining tribal traditions; insuring tribal well-bemg in huntmg and warfare; offering to the dancer perpetual prestige. I propose offenng a different mterpretive approach for the Sun Dance that cntically reflects on Bataille's theory According to this interpretation, the Sun Dance of the Sioux exhibits a threefold significance: existential, social, and cosmic. In other words, if one examines the many symbols associated with the nte, one will see that this sacnfice enables one to attain three levels of being. While the sacred pole was bemg pamted, mstructors and students sat m a circle around the black painted figures of a buffalo and man, each de- picted with exaggerated gemtals, m order to impart to the man the potency of Iya, patron-god of libertmism, and to the buffalo the potency of Gnaski, the crazy buffalo and patron-god of licentiousness (Walker 1980: 107-108). According to Black Elk's non-nsqué interpretation of the images, the buffalo represented all the four-legged animals on the earth, and the figure of the man signified all people (Brown 1979' 79). In contrast, Bataille would be quick to seize on the erotic connections of the patron gods of libertinism and licentiousness. However, if the erotic is a quest for sensual pleasure, repre- sents a realm of play, and reveals a foretaste of continuity, it cannot be used to interpret the meaning of Iya and Gnaski because within the context of the Sun Dance they more powerfully suggest the renewal and recreation motifs of the rite. Bataille's concept of eroticism also would not fit into an insightful interpretation of the Sun Dance as a dominant theme of the rite because of its anti-social character as a solitary activity accomplished m secret. The heterological method of Bataille is intended to alleviate the contra- dictions of life and free the individual from the homogeneity of the world. In contrast to Bataille's insistence on a search for radical difference, the world- view of the Sioux, embodied m the symbolic aspects of the Sun Dance con-ceived as an offering of body and soul to Wakan-Tanka (the Great Spmt), suggests a homogeneous view of the cosmos. The umverse, for mstance, is represented by the round form of the ceremomal drum, whose steady beat is the throbbmg at the centre of the cosmos (Brown 1979' 69). Within the context of the Sun Dance, the cosmic pillar of the umverse is represented by the cottonwood tree, which further represents the enemy who is symbolically killed and transported back to the centre of the campcamp by means of sticks because human hands are not allowed to touch the body The ntual partic- ipants consecrate the tree with the stem of the sacred pipe, another symbol of the earth, the buffalo, and everything that lives and grows on the earth. Once the tree is trimmed of its branches and its sides and branch tips are painted red, the rawhide effigies of a man and a buffalo are suspended from the crosspiece of the sacred tree, which is then placed into a hole at the centre of the camp. The sacred tree not only suggests a umversal pillar, but it also represents the wayway of the people (Brown 1979 69, 75-76). Other cosmic symbols are the sun and earth signified by a red circle, symbolic of all that is sacred. In the centre of the circle representing the sun is a blue circle which suggests Wakan-Tanka, the centre of the cosmos and all existence (Brown 1979' 71-72). Moreover, the lodge of the Sun Dance is composed of twenty- eight poles, each signifying an object of creation, and staked m a circle that represents the entire created world (Brown 1979' 80). It is difficult to find anything excessive or transgressme in these cosmic symbols of the Sioux that would support Bataille's position. Rather than achieving the differentiation that Bataille's theory advocates, the sun dancer symbolically acquires the cosmos. According to the ethno- logical report of Walker (1980: 114), the candidate who dances the most excruciatingly painful form of the dance with the intention of becoming a shaman is given a small hoop by his mentor. This hoop is symbolic of the sky, the four winds, time, all things that grow, and all circular thmgs made by the tribe. After his successful completion of the dance, the sun dancer is allowed to place this symbol on his tipi. This privilege suggests that he attams all that the hoop symbolizes. Contrary to Bataille's theory, the highest aspiring sun dancer does not find that the cosmos becomes other for him, and he does not stand as an individual sovereign within the cosmos. He rather becomes part of the whole, and he acquires the cosmos. Instead of perceiving the cosmic symbolism associated with the most painful performance of the rite, Bataille's writings suggest that he would stress its sadistic and masochistic aspects. Sadism, an excessive violation of modesty and a violent excretion, is not onlyonly an eruption of excremental forces, but it also forms a limitation by subjugating whatever is opposed to such an eruption (Bataille 1970-1988: II, 56). If masochism is an enjoyment of pain, the violence exercised on the flesh of the sun dancers would be viewed by Bataille as a transgression and violation of the participant's flesh, which also calls attention to the flesh itself and connects it to the erotic. Bataille also mamtams (1984: 91) that violence agamst the flesh is an external manifestation of the internal violence of the sacnficial participant, which is perceived as a loss of blood and vanous forms of ejaculations. Moreover, for Bataille the cuttingcutting of the flesh would be suggestive of the discontinuity of the self. Unlike the solitary activity of eroticism for Bataille, the sun dancer of the Sioux rite does not distinguish or divorce himself from his society because he represents the people and suffers on their behalf during the rite. After punfymg themselves, their clothing, and the equipment to be used m the nte, the participants crycry at the centre of the campcamp and assume the suffering of the people, which enables other tribal members to gain understanding and strength (Brown 1979' 72, 78). If there is present the discontinuity charac-tenstic of Bataille's profane human society among the Sioux, the Sun Dance bridges any social divisions by uniting the social bonds of a particular tribe and umtmg them with different Indian tribes. By means of an invitation from the tribe initiating the nte prior to its begmnng, other Indian tribes are invited to participate m the nte, even though some of the visitors may be hereditary enemies (Dorsey 1894: 452). This scenano enhances the social solidarity of the Indian nation and builds a closer relationship with the things of the um- verse ; the sacred centre created by the dancers is alleged always to be with them throughout the remainder of their existence. There is no evidence of transgressme or excessive social behaviour by the sun dancers m Bataille's sense. Moreover, the dancers have acquired a sacred power dunng the nte that they may later share with other members of their societysociety According to Powers (1977' 100), the acquired power of the sun dancers may be mvested m those who are sick by the placement of the dancers' hands on the less fortunate. Thereby the sacred power is shared to cure the sick, and enter into communion with others. In comparison to Bataille's theory, the sun dancers do not differentiate themselves from their society They share a sacred power that can benefit every member of the tribe. Bataille's heterological method and its stress on finding radical difference prevents him from seeing the socially unifying possibilities of a rite such as the Sun Dance. According to Bataille, violence is inevitable because human beings can- not totally reject it. In contrast to Bataille's theory, the Sun Dance represents a threefold sacrifice of which the initial two sacrificial actions are symbolic: cutting down the cottonwood tree which is symbolic of the enemy; shooting at the effigies of a man and buffalo suspended from the crosspiece of the sacred tree, and the final action of the actual sacrifice of human flesh on the fourth day of the rite. The second symbolic killing of the effigies of a man and buffalo, amid much rejoicing by the participants, represents the hope for future success m hunting and victory in war (Powers 1977' 98). These sym-bolic killings by the Sioux violates Bataille's assertion that violence cannot be controlled. Rather, the symbolic nature of the Sioux killings suggests a limiting and eventual termination of violence and not a promoting of any cycle of violence. Although Bataille is right to emphasize the importance of violence m sacrifice, there does not appear to be any danger that the con- tagious violence of the sacred will overflow and overwhelm the Sioux and other tribes. There are certainly martial features to the Sun Dance, but their symbolic nature suggests a containment of violence rather than any overflow- ing of it. Bataille's theory does make clear, however, that the Sioux accept violence, even though they try to reject or control it. Within the drama of the Sun Dance, there is a hint of an inherent prestige associated with victims who choose to perform the sacrifice in the most painful and violent manner. The actual sacnficial victims, for instance, can choose to dance m any of four ways-ways: gazing at the sun from dawn to dusk; having wooden skewers, tied to rawhide ropes secured about half wayway up the sacred pole, mserted into their breasts; having wooden skewers mserted mto the breasts and then being suspended about one foot off the ground; or having wooden skewers inserted which then are attached with thongs to one or more buffalo skull(s) that must be dragged along the dance area (Powers 1977' 98-99). The Sun Dance is not completed until the flesh of the victim has been torn through, representing the death and rebirth of the victim. It is permissible for others to assist by pulling on the ropes to end the victim,' agony As well, the multiple number of sun dancers contradicts Bataille's assertion (1988a: 59) that a victim represents a surplus of communal wealth and substitutes for other members of the commumty Neither is the victim an accursed share destmed for violent destruction. Bataille is nght, however, to emphasize the importance of death m sacnfice, which possesses the power to return one to continuity by means of eroticism. What he fails to see is the connection between death and spintual rebirth. And due to his notion of eroticism, which represents a disequilibrmm that stimulates a person consciously to call one's being into question, Bataille is not able to recogmze that the sun dancer is actually actually able to find his identity Although Bataille's theory of sacrifice does not account for the Sun Dance in its entirety, the rite does adhere to his theory to some extent because it calls attention to the flesh and reveals external violence and the internal violence of the subject. The violation and breaking of the sun dancer's flesh does suggest the usefulness of Bataille's observation about the intimate connection between human flesh and violence. However, by giving pieces of their flesh, the sun dancers impugn Bataille's claim that the violation of the victim's flesh connotes a connection to a sexual act. At this point, Bataille's theory is problematic because it lacks consistent sense m the context of the Sun Dance. Bataille's need to reintroduce eroticism blinds him to the facts or drama of an actual sacrifice. The flesh of the sacrificial victim m the Sun Dance represents ignorance (Brown 1979' 85) and not the dispossession of the self, an anti-social aspect of eroticism for Bataille. From an existential perspective, to be freed from the ropes tied to the skewers symbolizes freedom from the bonds of the flesh and not some erotic urge. The lack of an erotic emotion is evident m the symbolism of donning rabbit skins on the dancer's arms and legs. The rabbit is a symbol of humility, a virtue with which one must approach Wakan-Tanka. The victim is also equated symbolically with the sacred pipe that stretches from heaven to earth (Brown 1979. 74). In this context, the sacred pipe mdicates the transcending of earthlyearthly flesh. The dancer becomes the centre of the world m which the four directions meet when he is tied at the centre of the four poles, so that the four directions converge m his body (Brown 1979' 95). Within the drama of the Sun Dance, elements of eroticism, violence, and death are evident. This does not mean, however, that these features of sacrifice necessarily involve stressing separation, difference, transgression, and excess. Although it is possible to find these features in the Sun Dance to some degree, the Sioux nte stresses finding one's identity within a religious and social tradition. By successfully completmg the nte, a sun dancer does not separate himself from the group or become distinct from other things; rather, he often assumes a position of leadership within the tribe. And, as already noted, the sun dancer is intimately related to his mentor, ntual assistant or second, and other members of the tribe who play various roles m the nte. All this suggests the socially unifying nature of the nte. Moreover, within a tribal society such as the Sioux, the individual's identity is sociallysocially defined, even though one's visions and dreams help one to define oneself and one's place within a wider social context. Besides being a form of human sacnfice, the Sun Dance also functions as an initiation rite. The dancer, having died to his former ignorant condition, attains a totally new existential status of enlightenment and responsibility The ordeal that one endures is often accompanied by visions of the divine; the successful completion of the nte is a prereqmsite if one aspires to become a shaman. Walker (1980: 182) notes that after the successful completion of the Sun Dance the victim is eligible for leadership of a war party or for chieftamship. The candidate receives new meamng and status which is symbolized by the red design, drawn on his chest by the shaman as a symbol of all that is sacred. Furthermore, the victim is equated throughout the nte with the moon, which waxes and wanes, lives and dies, like all things (Brown 1979- 71). 7 Concluding remarks The significance of the Sun Dance enables us to see that there is an alternative interpretation to Bataille's theory that is more faithful to the actual evidence and is not simply imposed on the ritual activities by the creative imagination of a theorist. This interpretive analysis of the Sun Dance is suggested by the patterns exhibited by the nte itself and reflects more accurately the actual nte and its religious and symbolic context. Bataille, however, includes a personal agenda because he wants to re-introduce the erotic into religion. In other words, Bataille's theoretical speculation about eroticism shapes his theory of religion and sacnfice. Thus, his theoretical world-view takes precedence over the religious phenomena that he examines. With his involvement in the Surrealist movement, his emphasis on em- bracing bodily waste, his anal and erotic obsessions, the role of the ambiguous pineal eye in his works, and composition of excessively obscene novels, all suggest an explicit advocacy of decadence by Bataille. In his work entitled My Mother, the socially excessive theme is mcest. His novel The Blue of Noon, for mstance, focuses on the nauseous and squalid aspects of human life where its characters are engaged m endless orgies, vomiting, and unnat- mg. The erotic and death are contmually united in his Story of the Eye when, for example, the two leading libertmes of the novel have sexual mtercourse next to the cadaver of a young girl they have driven to death. Two further dramatic examples are the rape of a priest by the female protagomst and his death by strangulation and simultaneous sexual orgasm, and the death of the distracted matador gorged through his eye by the hom of a bull as he is distracted and blinded by the obscene antics of the female protagomst. Bataille's hermeneutical method of heterology is designed to lead to ex- cess and decadence. Trymg to explain his mithode de meditataon used m his book on religious expenence, Bataille wntes (1954: 216), "I think like a girl takes off her dress. At its most extreme pomt, thought is immodesty, obscen- ity itself." This kind of statement seems to suggest de Sade or Mephistopheles becommg Faust. In his work on heterology, Pefams summarily states (1991. 41) that the works of Bataille are "a theater of the excremental m whose scenes one may glimpse golden threads." Frednc Jameson (1991. 382), a self-admitted Amencan adherent of postmodern literary cnticism, affirms that decadence is a charactenstic of postmodermsm: "'Decadence' is thus in some way the very premonition of the postmodern itself, but under condi- tions that make it impossible to predict that aftermath with any sociological or cultural accuracy, thereby divertmg the vague sense of a future into more fantastic forms, all borrowed from the misfits and eccentrics, the perverts and the Others, or aliens, of the present (modem) system." And if, as sug- gested by Rosen (1987' 142), this decadence originates in political despair, Bataille's hermeneutical program is a political manifesto and not an apt tool for interpretmg religious phenomena. From a more positive perspective, Bataille's theory of religion does call attention to neglected elements in the study of religion in the form of bodily waste: excrement, saliva, tears, unne, mucus, dirt, skin, and so forth. Al- though his distinction between the sacred and the profane cannot be applied consistently as a useful hermeneutical device with the religious phenomena or world-view of Native Amencan Indians, his emphasis on the difference within the sacred itself is suggestive. He is also nght to stress the violent aspects of sacrifice and their sexual implications. Although violence is certainly present m the Sun Dance, the Sioux rite appears to move in the direction of nonviolence - by symbolically killing an enemy represented by a tree, for instance - that undermines Bataille's opinion that violence cannot be contained. By offering his body and soul, the Sioux sun dancer points to a renewal and continuance of cosmic generative forces. The Sun Dance also joins Indian societies together and provides for social continuity by allowing others to share m the sacred power engendered by the rituals. Moreover, the rite enables the sun dancer to become ontologically transformed by being reborn and being set free of his mortal flesh. Although there is a sense in which the sun dancer is distinctive, the emphasis of the nte is unity with societysociety and social well-being rather than stressing the differences between the sacrificial victim and society .

#### Bataille’s reasoning justifies atrocities and death.

Boldt-Irons, 2000 (Leslie Anne, Associate Professor of French at Brock University, “Military discipline and revolutionary exaltation: the dismantling of “l’illusion lyrique” in Malraux’s L’Espoir and Bataille’s Le Bleu du Ciel,” Romantic Review, vol. 91 issue 4, p. 481)

In 1933, Bataille contributed a review of André Malraux’s novel *La Condition humaine* to the ultra left-wing journal *La Critique sociale.*1 In this article, Bataille questions the place that revolution occupies in the larger and more general context of “human agitation.” He asks, for example, whether the convulsive movements of revolt, social upheaval, and revolution should be situated outside of, or above, what is normally experienced as life in its quotidian expressions of tenderness, enthusiasm or even hate. In the name of what authority, for example, might one be justified in placing the fascination with pleasure, torture and possible death outside the limits of acceptable social practice – extreme states often linked to revolutionary upheaval *outside* the limits of acceptable social practice? Another way of situating the convulsion of revolutionary movements – an approach clearly endorsed by Bataille – is to place it squarely within the framework of any activity marked by agitation. From this perspective, the acts of torture and murder would arise from an excitability or arousal similar in nature to that intensifying the fury of the revolutionary impulse. This impulse, writes Bataille, is a means by which the proletariat – who had for a long time been deprived of the possibility of attributing any value to suffering and to life – is able to gain access to value itself, a value linked to states of excitation unsubordinated to any simple political means or end. This value, and the state of agitation to which it is linked, gives the proletariat both life and hope, for which even death in all its atrocity might be the payment required.

#### Celebrating expenditure for its own sake is non-sensical – their criticism links to itself.

Richard Wolin, Distinguished Professor of History and Comparative Literature at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, 2004

[“"Left Fascism: Georges Bataille and the German Ideology," *The Seduction of Unreason: The Intellectual Romance with Fascism from Nietzsche to Postmodernism*, Published by Princeton University Press, ISBN 9781400825967, p. 165 *// BATMAN*]

At times, Bataille's celebration of transgression for its own sake seems woefully simplistic. In lieu of a conceptual framework that would permit one to distinguish between constructive and retrograde instances of transgression, we are left with an ethos of shock, rupture, and disruption simpliciter. Bataille seeks to ground postmodern ethics in the attitudes of a cultural avant-garde (Acephale and the College of Sociology) oriented toward precapitalist life forms that modernity has scorned. Yet the very idea of achieving a conceptual reckoning with Bataille-generated ideals such as "transgression," "heterogeneity," and "expenditure" would seem inimical to their very spirit. In his idiom, to rely on procedures of principled legitimation or a rational accountability would be to succumb to the logic and rhetoric of "productive consumption"—the values of a society predicated on instrumental reason and commodity exchange.

#### The critique is ivory tower elitism – only the rich and powerful can afford to expend without reserve.

Richard Wolin, Distinguished Professor of History and Comparative Literature at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, 2004

[“"Left Fascism: Georges Bataille and the German Ideology," *The Seduction of Unreason: The Intellectual Romance with Fascism from Nietzsche to Postmodernism*, Published by Princeton University Press, ISBN 9781400825967, p. 170-171 *// BATMAN*]

One could raise an analogous criticism of Bataille's treatment of potlatch—the public, demonstrative destruction of wealth—as well [end page 170] as gift-giving. In truth, only those who possess great wealth can afford to destroy it. Consequently, the option to engage in potlatch does not exist for society's lower classes. 56 Like sacrifice, potlatch is implicated in the reproduction of social hierarchy. Such acts reinforce the status and prestige of those who destroy their wealth. In nearly every case, the practitioners of potlatch belong to the upper strata of society. Those who are forced to passively endure the potlatch are in effect humiliated. Through such acts, their lowly social rank is reaffirmed.

#### Bataille got it all wrong – it is precisely because of the finiteness of life that it must be preserved – their value to life claims can only be made from a position that does not respect it

Jean-Luc Nancy, 1991, French Philosopher, “The Unsacrificable” Yale French Studies 79

But if sovereignty is nothing, if the “obscure God” is only the obscurity of desire ecstatic in the face of itself, if existence arranges itself only towards its own finitude, then we must think apart from sacrifice. On the one hand, what is at stake since the beginning of the Western sublation of sacrifice should definitively be acknowledged: strictly speaking we know nothing decisive about the old sacrifice. We need to admit that what we consider as a mercenary exchange (“Here is the butter…”) sustained and gave meaning to billions of individual and collective existences, and we do not know how to think about what founds this gesture. (We can only guess, confusedly, that this barter in itself goes beyond barter.) On the contrary, we know that, for us, it is absolutely impossible to declare: “here are the lives, where are the others?” (all the others: our other lives, the life of a great Other, the other of life and the other life in general). Consequently, on the other hand, it should be definitively acknowledged that the Western economy of sacrifice has come to a close, and that it is closed by the decomposition of the sacrificial apparatus itself, that bloody transgression by which the “moment of the finite” would be transcended and appropriated infinitely. But finitude is not a “moment” in a process or an economy. A finite existence does not have to let its meaning spring forth through a destructive explosion of its finitude. Not only does it not have to do so; in a sense it cannot even do so: thought rigorously, thought according to its *Ereignis*, “finitude” signifies that existence cannot be sacrificed. It cannot be sacrificed because, in itself, it is already, not sacrificed, but offered to the world. There is a resemblance, and the two can be mistaken for one another; and yet, there is nothing more dissimilar. One could say: existence is in essence sacrificed. To say this would be to reproduce, in one of its forms, the fundamental utterance of Western sacrifice. And we would have to add this major form, which necessarily follows: that existence is, in its essence, sacrifice. To say that existence is offered is no doubt to use a word from the sacrificial vocabulary (and if we were in the German language, it would be the same word: Opfer, Aufopfertmg). But it is an attempt to mark that, if we have to say that existence is sacrificed, it is not in any case sacrificed by anyone, nor is it sacrificed to anything. "Existence is offered" means the finitude of existence. Finitude is not negativity cut out of being and granting access, through this cutting, to the restored integrity of being or to sovereignty. Finitude utters what Bataille utters in saying that sovereignty is nothing. Finitude simply corresponds to the generative formula of the thought of existence, which is the thought of the finitude of being, or the thought of the meaning of being as the finitude of meaning. This formula states: "the "essence" of Dasein lies in its existence.22 If its essence (in quotation marks) is in its existence, it is that the existent has no essence. It cannot be returned to the trans-appropriation of an essence. But it is offered, that is to say, it is presented to the existence that it is. The existence exposes being in its essence disappropriated of all essence, and thus of all "being:" the being that is not. Such negativity, however, does not come dialectically to say that it shall be, that it shall finally be a trans-appropriated Self. On the contrary, this negation affirms the inappropriate as its most appropriate form of appropriation, and in truth as the unique mode of all appropriation. Also, the negative mode of this utterance: "being is not" does not imply a negation but an ontological affirmation. This is what is meant by Ereignis. The existent arrives, takes place, and this is nothing but a being-thrown into the world. In this being-thrown, it is offered. But it is offered by no one, to no one. Nor is it self-sacrificed, if nothing—no being, no subject—precedes its being-thrown. In truth, it is not even offered or sacrificed to a Nothing, to a Nothingness or an Other in whose abyss it would come to enjoy its own impossibility of being impossibly. It is exactly at this point that both Bataille and Heidegger must be relentlessly corrected. Corrected, that is: withdrawn from the slightest tendency towards sacrifice. For this tendency towards sacrifice, or through sacrifice, is always linked to a fascination with an ecstasy turned towards an Other or towards an absolute Outside, into which the subject is diverted/spilled the better to be restored. Western sacrifice is haunted by an Outside of finitude, as obscure and bottomless as this "outside" may be. But there is no "outside." The event of existence, the "there is," means that there is nothing else. There is no "obscure God." There is no obscurity that would be God. In this sense, and since there is no longer any clear divine epiphany, I might say that what technique presents us with could simply be: clarity without God. The clarity, however, of an open space in which an open eye can no longer be fascinated. Fascination is already proof that something has been accorded to obscurity and its bloody heart. But there is nothing to accord, nothing but "nothing." "Nothing" is not an abyss open to the outside. "Nothing" affirms finitude, and this "nothing" at once returns existence to itself and to nothing else. It desubjectivizes it, removing all possibility of trans-appropriating itself through anything but its own event, advent. Existence, in this sense, its proper sense, is unsacrificeable. Thus there is room to give meaning to the infinite absence of appropriable meaning. Once again, "technique" could well constitute such an horizon. That is once more to say, there must be no retreat: the closure of an immanence. But this immanence would not have lost or be lacking transcendence. In other words, it would not be sacrifice in any sense of the word. What we used to call "transcendence" would signify rather that appropriation is immanent, but that "immanence" is not some indistinct coagulation: it is made only from its horizon. The horizon holds existence at a distance from itself, in the gap or the "between" that constitutes it: between birth and death, between one and the others. One does not enter the between, which is also the space of the play of mimesis and of methexis. Not because it would be an abyss, an altar, or an impenetrable heart, but because it would be nothing other than the limit of finitude; and lest we confuse it with, say, Hegelian "finiteness," this limit is a limit that does not soar above nothingness. Existence alone breaks away from even itself. Does this mean rejoicing in a mediocre and limited life? Surely such a suspicion could itself come only from a mediocre and limited life. And it is this same life that could suddenly be exalted, fascinated, by sacrifice. Neither pain nor death are to be denied. Still less, if possible, are these to be sought after in view of some transappropriation. At issue, rather, is a pain that no longer sacrifices, and which one no longer sacrifices. True pain, doubtless, and perhaps even the truest of all. It does not efface joy (nor enjoyment), and yet, it is not the latter's dialectical or sublimating threshhold either. There is no threshhold, no sublime and bloody gesture, that will cross it. After all, Western sacrifice has almost always known, and almost always been ready to say, that it sacrificed to nothing. That is why it has always tended to say that true sacrifice was no longer sacrifice. Yet henceforth it is incumbent upon us to say—after Bataille, with him and beyond him—that there is no "true" sacrifice, that veritable existence is unsacrificeable, and that finally the truth of existence is that it cannot be sacrificed